WYLE TEST REPORT NO. T57381-01

DEMOCRACY SUITE 4.0

SOURCE CODE REVIEW REPORT
This review covers the Dominion voting system software. The review involved evaluation of its compliance with the Election Assistance Commission (EAC) 2005 Voluntary Voting System Guidelines (VVSG). This evaluation included, but was not limited to, the following considerations:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Readability</td>
<td>How straightforward and apparent was the design?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understandability</td>
<td>How complicated was the code to implement it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modularity</td>
<td>How well was the code divided into logical, functional units?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robustness</td>
<td>How well does the code handle error conditions or unexpected inputs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>Does the code protect the integrity of voting data at all times?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintainability</td>
<td>How easy would it be to extend, fix, or modify this code in the future?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency</td>
<td>Was the design of the code coherent throughout?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentation</td>
<td>Does the code contain useful and frequent comments?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Usability</td>
<td>Does the code inform the user about progress or errors?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flow control</td>
<td>Are control constructs and entry/exit points logical and controlled?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The technical reports detail specific instances where it was felt that the code fell short in some areas being reviewed, and lists directories, file names, line numbers, and notes to notify the maintainers of the standards violations.

**Initial Observations**

The submitted source code consisted of files organized by functionality into major sub-applications: EMS, ICC, ICE, and ICP. The EMS application was developed using C# programming language. ICC, ICE, and ICP were developed using the C++ programming language.

**Summary Assessment Findings**

In general, review of the source code modules comprising the submitted Dominion voting system software found that most of the code was written and commented to EAC 2005 VVSG standards. The majority of anomalies discovered during the review process consisted of issues dealing with comments, which is discussed in more detail below. Other deviations from the standards include:

- Non-conforming variable names (either one character names, names not differ by more than one character, or non-descriptive names);
- Parameters being used without proper validation,
- Source code lines that exceeded the maximum allowed length;
- Instances of over five levels of indented scope;
- Cases of no message upon exit;
- Exceptions thrown without a comment to describe where it is caught.
- Incomplete file reference in module header.
- Incorrect revision history in module header.
- Incorrect units called in module header.
- Non-uniform commenting style.
The following observations are intended to provide a summary of the most common commenting problems identified during the source code review.

i. Module Purpose

   a. The purpose is more cryptic than descriptive, lacking detail, and using generic terms that can be applied to source code other than the module it is attempting to describe;

   b. Poor language skills and/or spelling is used, which makes it very difficult to follow the intent of the comment.

ii. Variable Comments

   a. The most common problem with variable comments is the comment does not provide a clear description of how the variable is being used in the code.

iii. Inline Comments

   a. The reviewed source code contains many inline comments, which is very good; however, at times it appeared that inline comments were inserted into the source code merely for the exercise of it and not to provide additional information or description;

   b. Many problems identified with inline comments had to do with the comments being too cryptic or lacking in detail;

   c. The comments were often lacking a clear description of what the source code is doing.
3. Code Review Process

The source code went through several iterations of standards violations being identified by Wyle and Dominion attempting to bring the code up to standards. Code changes were made during the code review process that also had to be brought up to standards. All identified standards violations of the code, were corrected during this process.

4. Source Files

```plaintext
...\EMS\EMS 4.6.07
+-DEMOCRACY SUITE
 | +-ELECTION EVENT
 | | +-BallotRenderer
 | | | +-Attributes
 | | | +-BallotProduction
 | | | | +-NY2008
 | | | | +-GenElection
 | | | | +-Grid
 | | | | +-PriElection
 | | | | +-Properties
 | | | | \-Resources
 | | | |-Resources
 | | | | +-CandidateCellGrouping
 | | | | | +-ContestElements
 | | | | | | +-ControlFlow
 | | | | | | | +-DrawingWorkbench
 | | | | | | | | +-Extensibility
 | | | | | | | | | +-Callbacks
 | | | | | | | | | | \-MainMethods
 | | | | | | | | | | +-Infos
 | | | | | | | | | | | +-Interfaces
 | | | | | | | | | | | | +-LayoutProduction
 | | | | | | | | | | | | | +-Audio
 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | +-Components
 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | +-DrawingSupport
 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | \-Cache
 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | +-FreeSpaceManagement
 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | +-LayoutDistribution
 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | +-Positioning
 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | +-Producers
```
Adjudication\Client
  \Views
    +---userControl
    \-png
    +---userForms
    \-png
    \-AdjudicationSetup
  +---Automated Test Deck
    \-DVS.DemocracySuite.ElectionVerification
      \-Resources
    +---BallotOnDemand
      +---BallotOnDemand
      \-BallotOnDemand.png
      +---HTMLHelp
      \-Resources
      +---BallotOnDemand.Bilingual
      \-Resources
      +---BallotOnDemand.English
      \-Resources
      +---BallotOnDemand.Franch
      \-Resources
    +---Behavior Settings Manager
      +---GUI
        +---Editors
          \-PropertyForms
          +---Properties
          \-Providers
        +---CopyImages
          \-CopyImages.png
          \-Resources
        +---DVS.DemocracySuite.DCFFiller
          \-Properties
        +---DVS.DemocracySuite.EMSAudioStudio2010
          +---Device
            +---EMSAudioStudioPlayerRecorder
              \-Properties
            \-Interface
              \-Properties
            +---EMSAS2010.SetupCustomAction
              \-Properties
            +---EMSAS2010Setup
              +---Forms
              \-Properties
            \-Resources
+-Commands
  | +--Grid
  | +--LayoutRendering
  | +--LayoutTemplate
  | | +--LayoutPrimitives
  | | \--LayoutShapes
  | +--Properties
  | +--StyleDrawing
  \--Visiting
+-DVS.DemocracySuite.TabulatorGDomain
  \--code
  | +--Adapter
  | +--Ballots
  | +--ContestDefinition
  | +--Election
  | \--Properties
+-DVS.DemocracySuite.TabulatorGResultDomain
  \--code
  | +--Adapter
  | +--Properties
  | +--Raw
  \--Tabulated
+-DVS.DemocracySuite.USElectionsDomain
  +--code
  | | +--AdministrativeDivisions
  | | +--BallotsAndLayouting
  | | +--Commands
  | | +--ContestDefinition
  | | +--ElectionEventDefinition
  | | +--ElectoralDivisions
  | | +--LAT
  | | | +--Misc
  | | | | \--Consistency
  | | | +--Profiling
  | | | +--Report
  | | | +--Results
  | | | \--Tabulation
  | | \--Properties
  \--DVS.DemocracySuite.USElectionsDomain.GUI
    +--Commands
    | | +--ApplicationSettings
    | | +--Ballots
    | | +--ContestDefinition
    | | +--DevicesSettings
---NYC

---Resources
---NYGeneral
---Properties

---Resources
---Properties

---RankChoiceStyle

---Properties

---Rotation
---RotationManagers
---RotationMethods

---DVS.DemocracySuite.USElectionsDomain.ElectionFiles

---Actions
---AudioAdapter
---Audit
---BallotOnDemand
---BMD
---DCF
---Interfaces
---Properties

---ResultAdapter
---RifAdapter
---RifDefinition
---TotalResults
---VifAdapter
---VifDefinition

---WinEds

---DVS.DemocracySuite.VotingMethods

---code
---Methods
---Properties

---VotingRules
---code
---Properties

---Utilities
---DVS.DemocracySuite.EMSApplicationServer.Manager
---Properties
---Resources

---Import Adapters
---SMTTImportAdapter
---Setup
\---Setup_SMTT
\---SuffolkImportAdapter
\---SuffolkImportAdapter_Setup
   +++-Library Collector
\---FED_CERT
\---TestApp
   \---TestControlPanel
+++-DOCUMENTATION
+++-Framework
   +++-Applications
   \---KeywordDefiner
   \---tco files
   +++-Commands
   \---Attributes
   \---CommandLogging
   \---Consistency
   \---ObjectModification
   \---Permissioning
   \---Properties
   +++-DbMaker
   \---Properties
   +++-Domains
   \---Logging
   \---code
   \---Properties
   \---Parametrization
   \---code
   \---Properties
   +++-PermissionManagement
   \---CommandFiltering
   \---Navigation
   \---Properties
   \---SystemVariables
   \---code
   \---Properties
+++-GUIConfiguration
   \---Properties
++-GUICore
   \---Adaptation
   \---Attributes
   \---Commands
   \---Consistency
   \---Data
   \---Exceptions
---UserInterfaceInt
   \---code
   \---Listeners
...\ICP\ICP_4.6.4\DVS
+---bcrypt
+---cf2xx
+---cfload
+---common
+---core
+---devices
+---include
+---lib
 | \---election
| +--scripts
| \---tools
 |  +--applupdate
 |  +--common
 |  +--flashAuth
 | \---keyexchange